

HPC

Monroe County Historic Preservation Commission MINUTES

Monday May 6, 2019

Tavernier Fire House, 151 Marine Ave., Tavernier



2:00 PM Regular Meeting:

Call to Order.

Roll Call.

Present and answering to roll call were Chair-Commissioner Alice Allen, Commissioner Bert Bender, Commissioner Kate Deloach and Commissioner Brian Shea.
Absent was Commissioner Donna Bosold.

Staff present:

Devin Tolpin, Senior Planner
Peter Morris, Assistant County Attorney
Diane Silvia, Preservationist

Adoption of the Minutes from the February 4, 2019 meeting.

Alice Allen asked Peter Morris what they should do about approving the minutes as only she and Bert Bender were present at the February 4th 2019 meeting.

Peter Morris said they could go ahead and make a motion and even if unofficially approved, the information would be available to the public.

Bert Bender motioned to approve the minutes of the February 4th 2019 meeting. Alice Allen seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Changes to the Agenda.

There were no changes to the agenda.

Applications for Special Certificate of Appropriateness

1. Harold McMahan (File No. 2019-047) is proposing a revision to previously approved stairs that lead to the pool deck from the upper house deck, from wooden stairs to concrete at 197 Lowe Street, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00566370-000000 and legally described as:

All of Block 5, less the West 71 feet of AMENDED PLAT OF TAVERNIER BEACH, a subdivision in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 201, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

AND

A parcel of filled sovereignty land in Tavernier Harbor abutting Section 34, Township 62 South,

Range 38 East, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, said parcel being more particularly described as follows:

Commence at the Northwest corner of Block 5, Amended plat of Tavernier Beach as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 201 of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida; thence Easterly 312 feet along the North line of said Block 5 to its intersection with the Mean High Water Line as shown on said Amended Plat and the Point of Beginning; thence continue Easterly 10 feet along said North line of Block 5 extended; then South 6 degrees 15 minutes East 44.49 feet; thence South 23 degrees 12 minutes East 30.46 feet; thence South 85 degrees 52 minutes 45 seconds East 69.60 feet; to an Easterly extension of a line 23 feet North of and parallel to the South line of said Block 5; thence Westerly 96 feet along said Easterly extension to the Mean High Water Line as shown on Amended Plat of Tavernier Beach; thence Northerly 75 feet to the Point of Beginning.

AND

A parcel of submerged land in the Straits of Florida in Section 34, Township 62 South, Range 38 East, Key Largo, Monroe County, Florida, more particularly described as follows:

Beginning at an iron bolt on the shore of the Atlantic Ocean at the mean high tide line and on the dividing line between Block 5 and Lowe Street, all as shown on the Amended Plat of Tavernier Beach, according to Plat Book 1, Page 201, Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, and run South 84 degrees 43 minutes East on the Easterly prolongation of said dividing line a distance of 200 feet; thence North 5 degrees 17 minutes East, a distance of 23 feet; thence North 84 degrees 43 minutes West, a distance of 200 feet; thence North 84 degrees 43 minutes West, a distance of 200 feet to the said mean high tide line; then South along said mean high tide line a distance of 23 feet to the Point of Beginning.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Chuck Schafstall, agent for the applicant, had nothing further to add.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Staff response

There was no staff response.

Board discussion

There was no board discussion.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve the stair revision. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

2. Tavernier Hotel Holding, LLC (File No. 2019-050) is proposing to replace a demolished wood rear stairway with a steel stairway at 91865 Overseas Highway, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00555610-000000 and legally described as:

Lots 1, 2, 3, 4, 36 and 37, Block A, TAVERNIER NO.2, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 2, Page 8, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, together with that portion of the alley as disclaimed in Official Records Book 405, Page 1100 (Parcel Identification No. 1681946) lying adjacent to said lots, between the Northerly and Southerly lines of Lots 1, 2, 3 and 4 of Block A, extended Easterly to the center of the alley; and the portion of the alley lying adjacent to said Lots 36 and 37 of Block A between the Northerly and Southerly lines of said Lots 36 and 37 of said Block A extended Westerly to the center of the alley.

AND

Lot 5, Block A, TAVERNIER NO.2, according to the Plat thereof as recorded in Plat Book 2, Page 8, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida, together with that portion of the alley as disclaimed in Official Records Book 405, Page 1100 (formerly Parcel Identification No. 1681954) lying adjacent to said Lot 5 of Block A, between the Northerly and Southerly lines of said Lot 5 of Block A extended Easterly to the center of the alley.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines. She noted the old stairway encroached on the neighboring property.

Applicant presentation

Jorge Cepero, agent for the applicant, handed out color photographs of the property and other existing local stairways. He explained the old wood stairs were poorly built. The new stairs will be steel with concrete and have aluminum railings. The stairway is necessary for egress.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Board discussion

Alice Allen asked if we should deal with the issue of encroachment.

Staff response

Peter Morris said the HPC should review the design.

Devin Tolpin explained encroachment would be dealt with by the Planning and Building Departments.

Applicant response

Mr. Cepero said it is the elevated stair landing that encroaches. That area could not be built on anyway.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve. Brian Shea seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

3. THE PIGEON KEY FOUNDATION (File No. 2019-043) is proposing to remove and replace the Assistant Bridge Tender's home/museum roof with certain teed black roll on roof system and replace associated rotted wood as existing. The subject property is Pigeon Key, physically located at 44800 Overseas Highway and legally described as:

All of the lands heretofore deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District from the Florida East Coast Railway Company by deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, Pages 46 to 55, both inclusive, Monroe County, Florida, Public Records excepting therefrom all lands which have been deeded by said Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District and which deeds are of record as of the date of this conveyance to Monroe County, Florida, and also excepting the strip of land One Hundred feet (100') wide being Fifty feet (50') in width on each side of the center line of the right-of-way of the former Florida East Coast Railway, as same was constructed and operated between the center line dividing Sections Twenty-one (21) and Twenty (20) in Township 64, South of Range 36 East, to the Section Line between Sections Twenty-five (25) and Twenty-six (26) in Township 66, South of Range 29 East, including all trestles, structures, bridges and riparian rights, all in Monroe County, Florida, being part of the lands deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll-Bridge District by deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, pages 46 to 55, both inclusive, Monroe County, Florida, Public Records,

or AKA:

All of Pigeon Key, an island approximately 5.31 acres located at Mile Marker 45, along the Old Seven Mile Bridge, Lot 1, Section 13, Township 66 South, Range 31 East, Tallahassee Meridian, and deeded to the Overseas Road and Toll Bridge District from the Florida East Coast Railway Company by Deed dated November 9, 1936, and recorded in Deed Record G-6, pages 46 to 55, and thereafter deeded to Monroe County by Warranty Deed, recorded at OR-15, pages 374 to 376, having Real Estate Number: 00106120-000000.

Peter Morris read the requirements regarding possible conflicts of interest, specifically financial loss or gain.

Bert Bender stated for the record his firm is currently working on a historic structure report for Pigeon Key and that he has worked there through the years. He said he would recuse himself.

Mr. Morris said he could participate in the discussion, but not vote.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines. She said the State Architect, Rick Hilburn, does not approve of using 5/8ths plywood over the existing decking.

Applicant presentation

Kelly McKinnon was there to represent the project.

Public testimony

Randolph Wall said the NOA may require the 5/8ths plywood.

Board discussion

Bert Bender said the State Architect is correct, the addition of plywood is not appropriate. The existing decking should be securely fastened and any rotted wood should be replaced to match.

Kelly McKinnon said he has no issue with eliminating the plywood.

Motion

Bert Bender recused himself from voting.

Brian Shea motioned to approve with the condition that the addition of the 5/8ths plywood is eliminated. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. Alice Allen voted in favor and therefore, the motion carried.

4. JOE MIKLAS (File No. 2019-054) is proposing a revision to previously approved plans for doors on the new third floor enclosure at 240 Lincoln Avenue, within the Tavernier Historic District, Monroe County, Florida having real estate number: 00478200-000000 and legally described as:

Lots 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9, Block 10, LARGO BEACH, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 108, of the Public Records of Monroe County, Florida.

Staff presentation and recommendation

Diane Silvia read the staff report noting the applicable standards and guidelines.

Applicant presentation

Randolph Wall, the contractor and agent for the owner said he completely forgot to come back to the HPC with the revisions requested by the owner.

Public testimony

There was no public testimony.

Motion

Bert Bender motioned to approve. Kate Deloach seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

Other Business:

As there was no other business, the meeting was adjourned.

